

# Proceedings of International Congress on “Multidisciplinary Studies in Education and Applied Sciences”

Hosted Online from Los Angeles, California, USA on February 10th, 2023.

[www.conferencezone.org](http://www.conferencezone.org)

---

## ISSUES OF THE THEORY OF ARGUMENTATION IN THE WORKS ON ISLAMIC PHILOSOPHY IN MAVERANNAHR IN THE 8TH-12TH CENTURIES

Tulemetova G. T.

PhD in Social Philosophy, dozent

A number of researchers of Islamic civilization describe Bukhara, especially the Golden Age of its history - VIII-XII centuries, as the center of scientific thought, art. Also, as an environment that gave birth to many great local scientists and invited scholars from various parts of the Islamic world. The purpose of this article is to show how the scientific world of Bukhara convinced listeners and readers in the rightness of their ideas, what kind of proof was used, that is, what distinguishes a scientific work from other literary genres. In other words, what verification methods did the scientific thought of Bukhara use during the Samanids Period?

The term “verification” itself originated from two Latin words: *verus* - “true” and *facere* - “to do”. It is the process of verifying the truth of an action, event, object, or its quality after the examination. Verification gains particular value in theology, which divides statements mainly into true and false. For comparison, verification methods were used by: 1) Imam Bukhari during the selection of hadiths for “Al Jaami’ al-Sahih”; 2) representatives of the Kalam school; 3) Avicenna and others in their philosophical works.

Studying the process of verifying the hadiths for truth by Imam Bukhari in preparation for the publication of his collection of reliable hadiths proves that he effectively used verification methods in the IX century. The degree of the truth of Hadiths in the works of Imam Bukhari is multistage: reliable, that is, mostly and in detail confirmed; good, that is, mostly confirmed; weak, that is, probable, but not confirmed; and false.

Imam Bukhari travelled productively a lot in order to verify the material for his works, he visited almost all Islamic countries of his time, including Baghdad, which was the center of the caliphate and science. As a result, the foundation was laid for the main book of his – “Al Jaami’ al-Sahih” (“Collection of Authentic Hadiths”). Besides, commentaries on Qur’n, books on ethics, and history: “Manners in Islam”, “The Great History,” “The Medium History”, “The Brief History”, “Name of the Companions”, “Great Commentary on Koran”, “On Respect for Parents”, “The Book on the Nicknames of Hadith Narrators” and others were written.

## Proceedings of International Congress on “Multidisciplinary Studies in Education and Applied Sciences”

Hosted Online from Los Angeles, California, USA on February 10th, 2023.

[www.conferencezone.org](http://www.conferencezone.org)

---

Every book on Islamic theology has a section “The Book of Knowledge” [1]. According to F. Rosenthal, it was Ismail al-Bukhari who started this tradition. His “Book of Knowledge” is a “methodology of knowledge”, indispensable in the study of hadith [2]. Hadith verification was achieved by analyzing the content of the hadith (content analysis), followed by interviewing the chain of transmitters from the moment of its written fixation to the original source, i.e. to the Prophet Muhammad or his companion (isnad). As a result of verification, obtained a truth-checked informative part - the main text (matn).

Before recognizing the hadith as reliable (this is the initial requirement for selecting a hadith for the collection), Bukhari determined the criteria for their truthfulness and set appropriate standards for himself. He studied the lives of all people in the chain of hadith transmitters in detail; examined where and when the narrators lived, met with them, discussed the hadiths if they were told by someone else, and ascertained whether they were present at that time. Other hadith collectors did not require a personal meeting of the two narrators to clarify the hadith together. Thus, the method of verifying the fact, the so-called fact checking - a term that has been strengthened in recent years in science and journalism, is also related to the works of Imam Bukhari. In addition to the truthfulness of the content, fact-checking is characterized with the ethical aspect of the result of verification: fairness, impartiality, honesty.

Therefore, in “Al Jaami’ al-Sahih”, the goal that his teacher had set for al-Bukhari was achieved, and the future imam (Bukhari) did an excellent job with it. That is, he collected only reliable hadiths.

The same goal was pursued by the compilers of the Shia hadith collection. Just like the written version of the holy Qur'an (“Usman Mus’hafi”), the publication of hadith collections by Imam Bukhari was an important step towards the transition from oral Islamic culture to written one. This allowed a much larger number of Muslims to study the sacred sources of Islam independently. The wide distribution and authority of “Al Jaami’ al-Sahih” of Bukhari practically led it to canonization, its impeccability in Sunnism is equated to the second source of Islam after the Qur’an. Having become a kind of link between the era of early Islam in Arabia and everyday life, the “Collection of Authentic Hadiths” was used as a manifesto of traditionalism. It contains, all principles, from the fundamental to the smallest details, on how the life of Muslims was regulated. In addition to the practical issues of marriage, divorce, the manners of eating, shaving the beard, etc. there were hadiths on theoretical issues of faith, such as the creation of the

## Proceedings of International Congress on “Multidisciplinary Studies in Education and Applied Sciences”

Hosted Online from Los Angeles, California, USA on February 10th, 2023.

[www.conferencezone.org](http://www.conferencezone.org)

---

world, etc. Verified hadiths, using the example of the pious lifestyle of the Prophet, gave a model of behavior for Muslims.

At the same time, the appearance of such a detailed multi-volume work of Bukhari, which left a bright trace in the history of Islamic civilization, along with many other factors served as a cause for disagreement in Islam. Legal attitudes of various madhhabs, their polemics among themselves and with representatives of other faiths often went into philosophical discussions. This is due to the fact that in addition to the Qur'an → a common source and foundation in resolving legal issues → different madhhabs also use Sunnah, the instructions of religious authorities, the opinion of a religious community, local customs, traditions, and so on. The decision of the Faqihs of different madhhabs inevitably varied, which led to the formation of different currents and groups (firqa) in Islam. In addition, the coexistence of various religious schools, the development of new religious doctrines within the framework of Arab civilization also served as a factor encouraging heated debate.

Altogether, this accelerated the formation of the first trend of Arab-Muslim philosophy in the VIII century - Kalam (from the Arabic. - “speech”, “word”) and the appearance of its followers – mutakallim (Arabic. Mutakallim - “speaking”). Two stages are distinguished in Kalam: the early, Mutazil’a Kalam (from the Arabic. Mu'tazil - “isolated”), and the late, Ash’ari Kalam, by the name of its founder, Abu al-Hasan al-Ash'ari (d. about 935-936 yy.) [3].

Kalam is a speculative discipline that gives Islamic dogmas rationalist explanations, that is, based on reason (“aql”). Unlike Kalam, taqlid (Arabic: “following”, “imitation”) practices following the authority of the husband in deciding on important issues of Islamic law. Mutakallim preferred to draw independent logical conclusions from Islamic dogma instead of paraphrasing the opinions of the ulama (Islamic scholars). This is the difference between the Mutakallim and the dogmatic Salafis, who declared the Kalam heresy. Salafis (in Arabic - “ancestors”) - the early Muslim community in different periods of Islam, called for adherence to the beliefs and lifestyle of “righteous ancestors” and considered all subsequent innovations heresy. Besides, it is the common name of Muslims sharing the views of Salafism supporters. According to Ibn al-Jawzi (d. 1327 y), the methods of Kalam tested the strength of Mutakallim’s faith and led many of them to godlessness (“ilkhad”) [4].

Kalam arose and spread in the process of debate among various religious and political groups (Khawarij, Kadariyah, Jabiriyah, Murji’ah, etc.). In the Middle

## Proceedings of International Congress on “Multidisciplinary Studies in Education and Applied Sciences”

Hosted Online from Los Angeles, California, USA on February 10th, 2023.

[www.conferencezone.org](http://www.conferencezone.org)

---

Ages, the term Kalam was widely used in Islamic literature and meant any religious and philosophical judgment. In a narrow sense, Kalam is a section of Islamic theology that reinforces Islamic dogma with rationalistic arguments.

The Mutakallim made extensive use of reasonable arguments and logical reasoning in public debate. This brought them closer to the philosophers. The weakness of verification, as a method of verifying the truth in Islamic theology, lies in the fact that, being rational, it does not take into account religious dogmas (aqidah). Therefore, along with the principle of verification in religious philosophy, the principle of falsification (i.e., refutability) is used. Mutacallims were characterized by the use of the method of proof from the contradiction (ilzam). The opponent agrees with the thesis of mutacallim, and he draws a conclusion undesirable for the opponent, or absurd. A typical example: “Do you claim that there is no God? Can you prove that there is no God? No? Therefore, this concept is quite acceptable for study along with rational ones”.

The like-minded Imam Bukhari and the bright representative of Kalam - Muhammad Abu Mansur al-Maturidi (870-944 yy.), using the principle of falsification, published a series of “Denials” refuting the arguments of the mu'tazilites. Being a very erudite and experienced lawyer, Maturidi virally used the methods of falsification in evidence and possessed well-deserved authority [5].

Al-Ash'ari (representative of Shafi'i madhhab) and al-Maturidi (representative of the Hanafi madhhab) are great representatives of the Kalam. They tried to reconcile the supporters of the literal “retelling” (“naql”) and rational conclusions of “aql”. Prominent Muslim scholars such as Imam al-Ghazali (d. 1111 y.) have expressed positive and negative opinions regarding Kalam, based on the knowledge of his time. Rationalist principles, ways of thinking and reasoning, developed by Kalam, were adopted and creatively processed by later theological schools and philosophers.

The great scientist, born near Bukhara, ibn Sina (Avicenna), with the help of simple and understandable rules of logic, was able to bring rationalistic ideas of Aristotle of Neoplatonism and Farabism to Islamic dogma. Ibn Sina believes that in order to know everything, one must proceed from the principles of necessity, possibility, reality, and causality. The necessity is what certainly exists in the Universe; the possible is what is possible to exist under certain conditions. The necessity is a single, unconnected whole, the most powerful, wise Supreme God. Everything else is possible comes from God. The necessity and the possibility are

## Proceedings of International Congress on “Multidisciplinary Studies in Education and Applied Sciences”

Hosted Online from Los Angeles, California, USA on February 10th, 2023.

[www.conferencezone.org](http://www.conferencezone.org)

---

the relationship of cause and effect. This process is carried out gradually in the form of emanation, like sunlight. Therefore, the mind, the soul, and the body, given as opportunities, connected with the celestial spheres, turn into real things. God is eternal and the result of His creation - matter is also eternal [6]. All the work of Avicenna is an example of clear logic and reasonable evidence. Understanding that the search for truth is a formal process that does not depend on a person's desire, the scientist was a principled supporter of honesty and objectivity in science. Contrary to tempting offers, Avicenna, like Biruni, did not participate in questionable experiments of alchemists in converting simple metals into gold.

Verification as an important process of verifying the truth was widely used in the works of Imam Bukhari, Mutakallim and philosophers in the 9th-12th centuries. in Bukhara.

As a concept of modern philosophy, verification is advisable to apply in the philosophy of religion and in theology. Maintaining a high standard of Medieval traditions of verification and fact-checking, along with the improvement of modern techniques, serves to improve the quality of scientific products, trust in its truth, fights against plagiarism, fake information and distortion of facts.

### Reference

1. Sh. Ziyodov. Abu Mansur al-Maturudining yozma merosi va uning “Kitob at-ta’vilot” asari (Written legacy of Abu Mansur al-Maturudi and his “Kitab at-ta’valat”): doctoral thesis. – Tashkent, 2003. – 23 p .; See also: S.Oqilov. Abu-l-Mu’in an-Nasafiy va uning moturidiya talimoti rivojiga qo’shgan hissasi (based on the work “Tabsiratu-l-adilla”) (Abu l-Muin-an-Nasafi and his role in the development of the teachings of Maturidi (based on the work “Tabsiratu - l-adilla”)): doctoral thesis. ... – Tashkent, 2005. – 23 p.
2. Islomda bilim va ratsionalizm mavqei. Islom Falsafasi. (The position of knowledge and rationalism in Islam. Islamic Philosophy) URL: <http://faylasuf.uz/index.php/sharq-garb/falsafa-tarixi/islom-falsafasi/149-islomda-bilim-va-ratsionalizm-mav-ei> (date: 04/21/2014).
3. Wolf M.N. Medieval Arabic Philosophy: Mutazil’a Kalam. Textbook for graduate students of the Faculty of Philosophy on the course "Medieval Arab Philosophy". – Novosibirsk, 2005. – 4 p.



## Proceedings of International Congress on “Multidisciplinary Studies in Education and Applied Sciences”

Hosted Online from Los Angeles, California, USA on February 10th, 2023.

[www.conferencezone.org](http://www.conferencezone.org)

---

4. Islam: an encyclopedic dictionary. - The answer. ed. Prozorov S.M. – M.: Science, The main edition of oriental literature & SP “Dom Biruni”, 1991. – 129 p.
5. Tulemetova G.T. (2022) Religiovedcheskaya ekspertiza v Uzbekistane: metodologiya, problemy, podxody k ix resheniyu. Monografiya. T.: Izd. «Innovatsiya-ziyo», 2022. 208 s.
6. Gulchekhra Tulemetova. (2022) The Argumentation Theory in Kalam in Maverannah and Usage of its Practice Techniques in Discussions on the Websites of Uzbekistan // Global Journal of Human Social Science. Volume XXII Issue IX Version I.-P. 45 – 5. - [https://globaljournals.org/GJHSS\\_Volume22/6-The-Argumentation-Theory.pdf](https://globaljournals.org/GJHSS_Volume22/6-The-Argumentation-Theory.pdf) (Scientific Journal Impact Factor № 23)
7. Gulchexra Tajimatovna Tulemetova, G., Utkir Melibaevich Xasanbaev. (2021) K voprosu o nauchno-metodologicheskoy baze religiovedcheskoy ekspertizy v Uzbekistane i podgotovke kadrov v etoy sfere. Elektronnyy jurnal IIm-fan UzA. Dekabr, 2021. S. 333– 348.
8. Tulemetova G.T. (2022) Obshchenauchnye printsipy issledovaniya materialov religioznogo sodержaniya // Sharq mashali. 2022, № 4. -S. 161–173 (07.00.00; № 9)
9. Tulemetova G. (2022) Voprosy formirovaniya ponyatiynogo apparata religiovedcheskoy ekspertizy // Sharqshunoslik № 3.- S. 172–183 (07.00.00; № 10)
10. G. Tulemetova. (2022) Ratsionalisticheskie metody islamskogo bogosloviya i perspektiva ix ispolzovaniya pri ekspertize materialov religioznogo sodержaniya // “Islom ziyosi” ilmiy -tahliliy axborot jurnali. 2022 g., № 4. – S. 27–40 (07.00.00; № 21)
11. To’lemetova Gulchekhra. (1999) Yangilikni anglash zarurati. //“Tafakkur” jurnali № 4, 1999 y.- T. - B. 86–88. (07.00.00; № 20)
12. Gulchekhra To’lametova (2002) Shahar ekologiyasi.// “Tafakkur” jurnali № 4, 2002 y.- T. - B. 82–84 (07.00.00; № 20)
13. Tulemetova G.T. (2022) Nekotorye aspekty vliyaniya gosподstvuyushoy religioznoy kontseptsii na vybor metoda issledovaniya religii. // Buxoriy saboqlari jurnali № 4, 2022 y. B. 71–74 (07.00.00; № 17)
14. G. Tulemetova, Makhsudov D. (2017) Growth dynamics of Islamic studies in modern Uzbekistan (on the basis of dissertational research on religious studies in the period between 1992 and 2017). // Toshkent islom universiteti ilmiy-tahliliy axboroti, №4, 2017.- B. 16–19. (07.00.00; № 21)
15. Tulemetova G., Alimova M. (2017) European experience in supporting of religious tolerance. // // Toshkent islom universiteti ilmiy-tahliliy axboroti, №4, 2017.-B. 37–40. (07.00.00; № 21)